

ANM 328 Project 2 Critique

The objectives of the Creative Critter Project were to demonstrate blending skills, learn how to select compatible images and make adjustments in the overall composition to create consistent lighting effects. The final image should surprise us with an unexpected combination of critters or the environment the critter is in. The most successful projects will make this combination seamless and believable.

Grading Criteria:

95-100 Combination of images is creative, blends are flawless, shadows and highlights are consistent.

Demonstrates outstanding skill with Photoshop

90-94 Combination of images is creative, blending techniques are good with slight flaws in lighting consistency. Good knowledge and use of tools and composition

85-89 Composition is creative but blending has faults or lighting is not consistent.

80-85 Composition has less creativity in focus or scale, lighting not adequately considered, blending techniques need improvement.

70-79 Lacks Creativity, blending has major flaws or omissions, lighting not considered

Below 70 Low quality work in all aspects of the project

Late work: -10 pts

No Group Critique: -5

Mutter Group

Marchia Bond-This is one wild critter that I'd hate to tangle with..I can almost hear the hissing. The blend of wild and domestic cat parts helps transform the starting lizard image. The texture of the combined skin and fur looks a bit harsh and pixilated but it does work and adds tension to the collage. The pasted-in cat's eyes are the higher quality of the blended images and the piercing look complements the composition. It's a fine point but matching the dominant light source would add even more realism. Notice the direction of light coming from the left on the lizard's leg. Highlights added to the left side of the cat's nose would reinforce that lighting.

Faith Hess-Your critter is perhaps the most creative and unusual in class. I see the giraffe ears as if they are super sensors for the rabbit. The blending of the giraffe fur and rabbit fur is amazing. The pattern very subtly disappears into the fur with similar coloration. Overall it looks very believable. Good to see you use the cloud filter but it would be a nice additional touch to somehow ground your critter either at the bottom of the frame or on a hard surface like a rock.

Bibiana Lopez-The addition of the duck head on the horse is a straightforward blend of the two images. You've done a good job selecting the duck head and making room for it by removing the horse head. The transition from feathers to fur on the neck is more obvious than I'd like to see. Some of this is due to the yellow tint on the duck vs the white fur of the horse. An effective way to make the transition smoother is to use the sponge tool to slightly desaturate the yellow on the duck just to the point that it matches the horse color. I would also like to see the whole duck head in the frame not cut-off..looks like you may have cropped the original background image.

Catherine Serou-Your blend of creatures definitely has a prehistoric look with that curved snake head. The highlight of your composition is the transfer of the leopard markings to

the lion...these look very realistic. The modified mane doesn't necessarily look realistic but I do like the consistent color tone. Lighting on the snake is not consistent with the dominant light coming from the left on the lion's body. Just use the dodge/burn tool to adjust the highlights on the neck. Very creative and good use of blending techniques.

Dawn Zylema -I like your surfing-slithery-snail! Good job picking out three high resolution images for your critter collage. The blending looks good although with such a colorful head I might expect the other elements to radiate similar colors. You did not submit/include the required "smalls" so we could see what images you started with. I would also suggest you consider the dominant light in the scene which appears to come from top left and is bright sunlight. As a result, the snail shell should show some lighting variation (highlights) on the top to show consistency in the scene. You did a great job removing the girl from the board but left her reflection in the water. Fortunately that reflection "fit" the shell but snake head reflection should also be added in a similar style to be consistent.

Kelsey Garrett-The bear-lion is a very imposing and beautiful critter! You've done a great job of selecting the furry panda head and maintaining reasonably good detail around the edges. As a result the blend of the two furry creatures looks realistic. The one thing that take slightly away from the total success of the composition is the lighting on left side of the head. There's a brighter ring of fur behind the darker face of the panda. To lighten the left edge of the panda's face select the dodge tool with a soft large brush and paint over to brighten to get the desired look.

Monroy Group

Kathern Bond-Your creative critter is a composite of two birds, which is a great concept. My concern is that you've chosen small sized bird images which makes it very difficult to see the detail where the heron head is attached to the eagle body. How you blend these elements is of key importance. The background image of an iceberg has potential, if the scale and resolution of the birds matched the berg. As composed, the iceberg has very low resolution and just doesn't "fit" the scene. One technique that can help compare images is to set the percent enlargement the same for all images you plan to use and view together. If you do this, you will see how scale and resolution compare and can make the best decisions about their compatibility.

William Goff-How funny to see the combination of rabbit and chicken. I do appreciate the consistent resolution of the two images, a key factor in successful composites. You've done a good job selecting the chicken's head off the original background. The feathered edges pose a challenge with selections. I can see a hard edge at the back of the chicken which doesn't look as realistic as it could be. The refine edges technique is designed for just this situation. I would like to see the coloration of either the chicken or rabbit be better blended across the transition between the two parts. The brownish markings on the chicken could be selectively desaturated with the sponge tool to match the tone/color of the rabbit at the transition area to enhance realism.

Danielle Korotkin-I'm delighted to see how successfully you removed the fencing from the original image of the rhino. This set the stage for selection and blending of the bear's head. Both images have consistent resolution which adds to believability. You've also done a very effective job in blending the bear's fur into the rhino hide. From a compositional point of view, I would recommend cropping the image to remove the pole at left.

Amanda Rodman-This is one scary squirrel that I'd hate to run into. You've done a great job of blending both the lizard/crocodile head and the feet onto your basic critter. The transition points are strongest on the neck where the scales turn into fur. Feet look believable but might be a touch more realistic if tone/color of all feet was similar. You could adjust this (for example) by selecting the bottom feet and go to image>adjustment>hue/saturation and play with the sliders to warm-up the tone to match the front feet. Nice work!

Oscar Varela-I must admit your starting critter is pretty strange to begin with! The addition of the horns and bird face meet the project goals. Lighting on the horn is not quite consistent with the light on the background/animal. Try using the burn/dodge tools to modify highlights. The transition of feathers to fur on the head is a little harsh. If the animal's forehead and ear were lightened, perhaps desaturated with the sponge tool it would be more realistic.

Adams Group

Rudy Carson-Your starting image of the piglet and beer mug offers lots of potential for creative additions. Modifying the critter with a new head is an obvious choice. You've done a good job of selecting the bear head off the body and layering it over the original. But the head just doesn't look like it "fits" the pig. The primary reason is that the resolution/detail of the bear is less than the pig. One way to compare images for resolution is to set their percent enlargement to the same value. Side by side you'll see how they compare. The head also appears to be raised in front of the body due to inconsistent lighting. With light coming from the left, there would be a slight cast shadow from the head onto the body. The best way to do this would be add a drop shadow to the head while you still have it layered over the body or you could manually add a hint of a shadow with the brush tool. You can adjust opacity, softness and direction to make it look as realistic as possible with both these techniques.

Jolaine Huss-Your lion-lizard would be one formidable critter to run into. I like the concept and scale of the composition but the head just doesn't match due to color and the hard edge selection of the furry edges. As far as the selection goes, this is a challenging situation due to the fine fur and the busy background. The refine edges technique that we used for the selection tutorial is likely the best way to approach this and get as detailed an edge as possible. Once the head is added to the body, in this case, I would try to more closely match the fur color to that orange tone of the lizard body. While the head is on its own layer go to image>adjustments>hue/saturation select colorize and adjust the sliders to visually match color. The head will likely appear to be a little flat until you reestablish the white highlights around the mouth and eyes. Use the sponge (O) tool to remove color in these areas. You'll see the image come to life.

Noah Martin-You have certainly found a creative critter with your camel-dog mix. The selection of the head looks clean although without the small source images it's impossible to see what challenges, if any you faced with the compositions. The blend of the head at the neckline is softened slightly to add realism. Still the transition looks a little harsh. I'd suggest trying the sponge tool to selectively desaturate some of the camel beige color to elongate the transition visually. Lighting on the camel head is not quite consistent with the stronger light on the dog's body. You see it adds a sheen to the dog's coat which you should be able to replicate with the dodge (O) tool.

Stephanie Sutter-This is quite a critter...I see the piglet and think that the other creature is an ocelot. Without your original images (project requirement), I can't assess the challenges of your selections. The blending, however, looks good, especially on the forehead ears and legs. The nose/mouth area is a little soft....don't know if this was due to the softness of the original or techniques you used in the composition but it should be sharper. Some sharpening could be done by selecting the mouth area (quick selection too) and then applying the unsharp mask (filter>sharpen>unsharp mask) which is adjustable and allows you to compare sharpness with other areas of the image for consistency. Note: Your group feedback should be added to the Adams group.

Taylor Group

Brian Coffman-I can only guess that your doggie was getting ready for St Patrick's day? The idea of colorizing the dog is fine and certainly enhances the creative critter concept. The addition of the duck head and positioning of the Frisbee is a little problematic. The duck head itself is a logical modification that fits the green dog but the transition from duck to dog is too harsh and looks unnatural. The best way to deal with this would be to soften that edge by making the darker duck feathers more transparent. In this case, I'd recommend the eraser tool applied to the duck while it's still on its own layer to smooth the transition. The disk would be more believable if it were in the duck's mouth similar to how it looks on your original dog. Whether you use the disk or a ball you have to edit the object so it's positioned in the mouth using editing tools or, as we will learn, by using masking which gives more control over this type of editing.

Taylor Johnston-Your lizard-deer is one of the most successful critter in the class! I like it because your images were of consistent high resolution and you've carefully matched the tone of the deer and lizard to make the transition undetectable...that's great. I also see that you modified the horns to better fit the new head and broadened them out in a more dramatic fashion. You've demonstrated excellent skill with the tools and the result is a outstanding composition.

Heather Merrifield-You were one of the only artist to place your critter in an unexpected environment. I wonder if Mr Bear is in class or attending a briefing on bear law? The selection of the bear is good and you've managed to retain the texture of the fur around the edges. The image itself is quite small..it would have been more interesting and challenging if the bear was in the front row. As is, the bear resolution is a little soft compared to the adjacent figure. Did you consider putting a bear name on the placard? It

does appear that you edited the bear image, which had bright highlights, to make it more consistent with the indirect light in the room...that's an excellent observation.

VickyVang-Your crock-stallion is amazing! The dramatic image of the horse definitely fits the elongated snout of this reptile. You've done an excellent job of adjusting the tone of the gator's head to match that of the horses body and the transition of skin to fur is very precise...I can see that you've cloned some skin into the fur to make it as realistic as possible. I don't have any suggestions except to say that it's outstanding work!